

DISCUSSION PAPER

Global Summit of National Ethics Committees

Carthage, Tunisia

26-28 September 2012

Working Group on Organ, Cell and Tissue Transplantation

Acknowledgements

This document was prepared by the NEC Working Group on Organ, Cell and Tissue Transplantation for the 9th Global Summit of National Ethics Committees.

We would like to thank the members of this group, namely:

Hugh Whittal (Chair of the Working Group), Mohamed Chebil, Leonardo De Castro, Christiane Druml, Hele Everaus, Patrick Gaudray, Alain Grimfeld, Zouheir Jerbi, Kamal Kallab, Hamed Mestiri, Marie-Hélène Mouneyrat, Siobhán O'Sullivan, Sigrid Sterckx, and Katherine Wright.

In addition we would like to thank Nikola Biller-Andorno (Institute of Biomedical Ethics, University of Zurich), member of the WHO Collaborating Centres for Bioethics.

Finally we extend our thanks, for technical support, to the World Health Organization Secretariat, hosted by the Ethics and Health Unit, WHO in Geneva and interns Stefano Crétier, Esther Davis, Regina Ram, Tuua Ruutinen and Lynn Woodward.

Table of Contents

I. Background to this document.....	4
II. Introduction	5
III. Statement of the problem	7
IV. Responsibilities of States.....	8
V. Responsibilities of National Ethics Committees	9
VI. Statement of principles	10
VII. Areas where consensus is more difficult.....	11
VIII. Issues for consideration	12
Annex 1.	13
Statements made by NECs in relation to organ donation or transplantation.	
Annex 2.	20
Alignment of NECs statements on organ donation or transplantation and the WHO Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation.	

I. Background to this document

This paper sets out, for the purposes of discussion among the delegates at the Global Summit of National Ethics Committees (NECs), a number of issues in relation to the donation, transplantation and use of tissue, organs and other bodily material. It is not intended to represent a common position or declaration, but to provide an opportunity for discussion of an issue that is of concern to all states, and to raise points of action that individual states and international organizations and institutions may consider.

II. Introduction

In many countries there is an increasing need and demand for donated human material for health purposes, both for transplantation and research. The material includes whole organs (such as liver, kidney, heart, lungs, pancreas, etc), blood, gametes (eggs and sperm), bone, and other tissue and cells. Such material is important in terms of human health as it has the potential to save life (eg through organ transplantation and blood transfusion); to enhance people's state of health (e.g. through tissue transplantation, fertility treatment, etc); and to facilitate health-related research.

The demand for donated human material will vary among countries, it is recognized that organ transplantation and IVF treatment, for example, would not be priority areas in many countries, while issues surrounding the availability of other human material, such as blood, will be common to all.

The increasing need for such material arises through both medical advances which increase the number of treatments available and the number of people for whom they are likely to be effective; and through changes in people's lifestyles (such as poor diet, tobacco and alcohol use) which give rise to higher incidence of, for example, liver, kidney and heart disease.

As a result of these increased demands, the shortage of donated bodily material is becoming increasingly acute.¹ This presents particular issues for WHO member states in terms of how to manage the demand for tissue and organs; how to respond to the need for donated material; and how to regulate the system to avoid exploitation of those who might be vulnerable to undue pressure to donate.

While many states have legal and regulatory measures in place in relation to the donation or procurement of bodily material, and a number of international instruments have been established (eg by the European Union,² WHO,³ Council of Europe,⁴ Istanbul Declaration⁵), these are generally limited in scope (e.g. covering

¹ In July 2010, 107,882 people were waitlisted for transplantation in the United States, of these more than 85,000 were awaiting renal transplant, and 15,000 were awaiting liver transplantation (Organ Procurement and Transplantation Network, 2010a, Overall by Organ: Current U.S. waiting list). In 2009, 6,494 patients died waiting for a transplant (United Network for Organ Sharing, 2009, UNOS, 2009 Annual Report, pg 11). In Australia it is estimated that one person per week dies while awaiting renal transplantation (Kidney Health Australia, 2010, Organ Donation, Fast Facts). In the 2008-2009 financial year 448 patients died awaiting transplantation in the UK (NHS: Blood and Transplant Statistics and Audit Directorate, 2009, Transplant Activity in the UK 2008-2009, pg 4) and in the Eurotransplant region 1,302 patients died while on the waitlist for organ transplantation (Oosterlee A and Rahmel A, 2009, EUROTRANSPLANT international foundation: Annual Report 2009, pg 40). The council of Europe estimates that 4,000 EU citizens died while waiting for a transplant in 2007 (Caplan A, Dominguez-Gil B, Matesanz R and Prior C, 2009, Trafficking in organs, tissues and cells and trafficking in human beings for the purpose of the removal of organs: Joint Council of Europe/United Nations Study, Council of Europe, France, pg 21).

² EU Tissues and Cells Directive (2004/23/EC) and EU Organ Directive (2010/45/EU).

³ World Health Organization (2010) *Guiding Principles on human cell, tissue and organ transplantation*.

⁴ Council of Europe (2002) Additional protocol to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, on transplantation of organs and tissues of human origin

only organs and not other bodily material), limited in extent (e.g. covering only national arrangements), or limited in effectiveness (e.g. non-binding declarations). As a consequence, a number of problems persist due to the scarcity of donated material, including transplant and fertility tourism; the trafficking of organs between different states; the trafficking of people for the purpose of organ procurement; and the development of illegal markets in which individuals are encouraged to sell their organs or other bodily material.

An issue that National Ethics Committees might consider and discuss is whether there are problematic gaps in current regulatory and policy arrangements; and, if so, whether there is a need for action on the part of states, of international or intergovernmental organizations, or of individual Ethics Committees.

⁵ The Declaration of Istanbul Custodian Group (2008) *The Declaration of Istanbul on Organ Trafficking and Transplant Tourism*.

III. Statement of the problem

Increased need/demand together with low rates of donation lead to a shortage of tissue and organs for treatment and research purposes. Due to an organ supply shortage, people in need of tissue and organs for therapeutic purposes remain untreated, leading some to explore alternate avenues for organ procurement.

As a result of the shortage of organs and reproductive material in particular, a growing market has developed in which people travel to other countries for treatment when it is not available in their own country.⁶ Illicit markets have developed for the trafficking of organs and people from low and middle income countries.^{7, 8}

⁶ Transplant tourism oftentimes involves patients from wealthy countries (also referred to as 'organ importing countries') travelling to poorer (or 'organ exporting') countries where they receive an all inclusive 'transplant package'. The organs for transplant in these circumstances come from living unrelated donors who are normally financially compensated in some manner for their donation, or deceased donors and in some circumstances are taken from executed prisoners (Shimazono Y, 2007, Public Health reviews: The state of the International organ trade, Bulletin of the World Health Organization, December 2007, 85 (12) pg 955-962).

⁷ It has been estimated that between 5-10% of renal transplants worldwide are a result of organ trafficking. This would mean that up to 7,000 transplants a year are being performed using trafficked organs (Caplan A, Dominguez-Gil B, Matesanz R and Prior C, 2009, Trafficking in organs, tissues and cells and trafficking in human beings for the purpose of the removal of organs: Joint Council of Europe/United Nations Study, Council of Europe, France, pg 58).

⁸ The fifth principle of the WHO Guiding principles on organ transplantation states that cells, tissues and organs should only be donated freely without any monetary payment or other reward since paid donation may exploit the poorest and most vulnerable in the world and 'conveys the idea that some persons lack dignity, that they are mere objects to be used by others' (2010 WHO Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation, pg 5).

IV. Responsibilities of States

States have a general responsibility to provide for the health needs of their people, and to protect them from exploitation. In this context, it could be claimed that:

- States should take appropriate action in respect of public health interventions to enable their populations to live healthy lives, minimizing the need for tissue and organ transplantation;
- States should take appropriate steps to encourage the donation of organs and other human bodily material, and to establish infrastructures for providing services as appropriate to the specific health needs of their populations; and
- States should take appropriate steps to prevent the trafficking of people and organs and to protect those who may be vulnerable to such activities.

V. Responsibilities of National Ethics Committees

The precise role of National Ethics Committees varies between countries. However, core responsibilities include providing a forum for the discussion of bioethical issues at a national level, monitoring practices, and influencing policy in their countries by publishing recommendations on these issues. NECs' responsibilities with respect to the donation of bodily material could thus include the following:

- In countries where there is no legislative or ethical guidance for the regulation of the donation and use of bodily material, taking an active role in bringing public attention to this issue and advising on potential requirements;
- In countries where some such guidance exists, monitoring the extent to which all relevant aspects are covered, and the extent to which these match up with international standards; and
- In countries where well-developed regulatory and ethical standards exist, monitoring the extent to which these match up with international standards, promoting informed debate on these issues, and providing support in these areas, where appropriate, to other NECs.

An account of the work undertaken in the area of organ and tissue donation for transplantation (excluding reproductive tissue, and donation for research) by NECs, and the extent to which NECs' reports reflect the WHO *Guiding Principles*, is available in Annex 1 and 2 respectively.

VI. Statement of principles

In order to progress discussions there is some merit in first considering areas of general alignment. Following are a number of statements that could be made as general propositions to which most discussants could agree. For example:

- Research using human tissue, and transplantation of human tissue and organs, including reproductive tissue (sperm and eggs) is of significant value for human health;
- There has been an increase in the need and demand for human bodily material for research and treatment purposes;
- The shortage of tissue and organs has adverse consequences on both unmet health needs and illicit activities that adversely affect the most vulnerable states and populations;
- The value of donation is an act of solidarity towards others, whether donation takes place after death or during life;
- Vulnerable persons should receive appropriate protection from exploitation;⁹
- The direct sale by living individuals of their own tissue and organs for transplantation purposes is contrary to human dignity and well-being;¹⁰
- The trafficking of human organs or persons for transplantation purposes is universally condemned.

⁹ The seventh principle of the WHO Guiding principles on organ transplantation requires that “Physicians and other health professionals should not engage in transplantation procedures, and insurers and other payers should not cover such procedures, if the cells, tissues or organs concerned have been obtained through exploitation or coercion of, or payment to, the donor or the next of kin of a deceased donor.” (2010 WHO Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation, pg 6).

¹⁰ However, the Iranian model of a state-regulated system of paid organ donation compensates living unrelated donors. This model has resulted in Iran being the only country in the world without a waiting list for renal transplantation (Ghods, 2007, Organ Transplantation in Iran, Saudi Journal of Kidney Disease, Volume 18 (648-655)).

VII. Areas where consensus is more difficult

To facilitate further discussion the following have been identified as issues related to the donation and use of bodily material where a number of ethical stances, at times differing significantly, may be discerned both within and between countries. The list is not conclusive and it is anticipated that on analysis of the NEC questionnaire further areas may be identified. Areas of contention include:

- The ethical justification of regulatory differences regarding different forms of donated material. Reproductive material is often treated differently from organs and non-reproductive tissue: for example there is a degree of acceptability of payment to the donor, while there remains a lack of international guiding principles to protect egg donors from abuse or exploitation.
- The acceptability of financial compensation for a donor, either through reimbursing directly-incurred expenses (such as travel expenses) or through compensation for the time, inconvenience and discomfort involved in donation.^{11, 12}
- The appropriateness of encouraging living organ donation, especially where there are potentially opportunities for a significant increase in deceased donation.
- In the context of deceased donation, the form of authorization or consent required (advance authorization from donor, authorization at the time by family members, 'opt-out' system etc) in order for organs or tissues to be removed for transplantation or research purposes.
- The ethical acceptability of 'donation after circulatory death' (DCD, formerly known as non-heart-beating donation).
- The way death is determined by national law or through national medical professional standards.

¹¹ Literature regarding living organ vendors have suggested that the majority of commercial vendors sell kidneys to repay debt, that money obtained from organ donation rarely provides a lasting improvement in their economic status and that 98% experience a decline in health following organ donation (Naqvi, 2007, A socioeconomic survey of Kidney Vendors in Pakistan, Transplant International, Volume 20(11) pg 934-9).

¹² Some NECs have considered implementing an incentive based system of donation in order to deal with current organ shortages (Bioethics Advisory Committee Of Belgium, 2007, Opinion No. 43, December 10, 2007 on the issue of commercialization of human body parts). This option has been widely considered in the literature, and some argue that it is an ethically viable manner of increasing the number of organs available for transplant. This position is not, however, consistent with the principles of the WHO, nor is it allowed under any of the other current international guiding statements on organ transplantation.

VIII. Issues for consideration

Discussion at the Summit might focus first on consideration of the general principles outlined above in Section V; and then on more detailed consideration of a selected number of the issues listed above in Section VI, where lower levels of consensus currently exist. Given the short timescale of the summit, it is suggested that the most fruitful focus at the event itself would be in those areas where either greater consensus, or greater clarity as to the relevant ethical concerns, are likely to be achieved as a result of the discussion.

A number of particular issues can be identified in terms of what might be needed to take the discussion forward:

- Identification of international declarations regarding human tissue and organ donation and transplantation,
- Monitoring and regulation of human trafficking or bodily material for transplantation purposes;
- Mapping of regulatory position at global/regional/country level;^{13, 14}
- Mapping of provisions in relation to different bodily materials (organs/tissue/reproductive material) and for different purposes (treatment /research);
- Identification of key principles that are commonly held (e.g. non-payment for bodily material; solidarity in donation; prevention of harm and exploitation);
- Consideration of circumstances in which forms of payment might be legitimate (e.g. recovery of expenses, compensation for lost wages and/or risk, payment in the context of research, etc);
- Identification of basic steps that states should take (e.g. public health measures; promotion of donation; support for the infrastructure needed for efficient and effective donation services; legal prohibition of trafficking);
- Identification and mapping of national ethical guidance in connection with techniques such as DCD organ donation,¹⁵ in order to promote active and constructive discussion of ethical concerns; and
- Identification of gaps at international level to promote health and prevent exploitation in relation to donation and transplantation of human material.

¹³ The revised WHO Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation were endorsed by the World Health Assembly in May 2010 (63rd World Health Assembly, WHA63.22: WHO Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation, 21st May 2010, Geneva Switzerland). While the scope of the principles broadly includes organs, tissues and cells, it does not apply to 'gametes, ovarian or testicular tissue, or embryos for reproductive purposes, or to blood, or blood constituents, collected for transplantation purposes' (Ibid, pg 1).

¹⁴ Previous international guidelines include those from the Council of Europe (2010, Additional Protocol to the Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine concerning Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin: Chart of Signatures and Ratifications); the Declaration of Istanbul (The Declaration of Istanbul on Organ Trafficking and Transplant Tourism, Clinical Journal of the American Society of Nephrology, Vol 3, pg 1227-1231), and the World Medical Association 2006 Statement on Human Organ Donation and Transplantation.

¹⁵ See, for example, the guidance produced in 2011 by the UK Donation Ethics Committee ('An Ethical Framework for Controlled Donation After Circulatory Death: Consultation'). Available at <http://aomrc.org.uk/about-us/news/item/an-ethical-framework-for-controlled-donation-after-circulatory-death-report.html>.

Annex 1. Statements made by NECs in relation to organ donation or transplantation.

Country and Region	Nature of Statement on Organ Donation or Transplantation.
<u>Mexico (AMRO)</u>	1. Code of ethics for Health Personnel ¹⁶ (2002)
<u>Tunisia (EMRO)</u>	1. Opinion Paper On Organ Samples and Tissues on Corpses 'Medico-Legal'¹⁷ (October 22, 2007) 2. Publication from the Xth Annual Conference of the National Ethics Committee - Organ Donation: Questions and Reflections¹⁸ (November 2006) 3. Speech by President of the Tunisian National Bioethics Committee - Organ transplants and Medical Ethics¹⁹ (April 2003) 4. Speech by President of the Tunisian National Bioethics Committee - Ethics and Therapy by Substitution of Bodies²⁰ (October 1997)
<u>Belgium (EURO)</u>	1. Opinion No. 50 on <i>certain aspects éthiques des modifications apportées par la loi du 25 février 2007 à la loi du 13 juin 1986 relative au prélèvement et à la transplantation d'organes</i> (May 9, 2011)²¹ 2. Opinion No. 43 on the issue of commercialization of human body parts²² (December 10, 2007) 3. Opinion Paper - On The Collection of Organs and Tissues in Healthy Living Subjects for Transplantation²³ (December 20, 1999).

¹⁶ National Bioethics Committee of Mexico, 2002, Code of Bioethics for Health Care Professionals, Online Available from http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=es&tl=en&u=http://cnbmexico.salud.gob.mx/descargas/pdf/normatividad/normatinacional/1. NAL. Cxdigo de Bioetica del Personal de Salud.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usg=ALkJrhiE1tkoy17nMv6rnuTHIxHeyAoWvw (14th July 2010)

¹⁷ National Medical Ethics Committee of Tunisia, 2007, Opinion Paper On Organ Samples and Tissues on Corpses 'Medico-Legal', Online Available from http://www.comiteethique.rns.tn/ethique/avis/AVIS_DON_ORGANES.pdf (14th July 2010)

¹⁸ National Medical Ethics Committee of Tunisia, 2006, Publication from the Xth Annual Conference of the National Ethics Committee - Organ Donation: Questions and Reflection, Online Available from http://www.comiteethique.rns.tn/ethique/CONFERENCES/conf_don_organes.pdf (14th July 2010)

¹⁹ National Medical Ethics Committee of Tunisia, 2003, Organ Transplantation and Medical Ethics , Online Available from http://www.comiteethique.rns.tn/ethique/CONFERENCES_ET_PUBLICATIONS/GREFFE_ORGANES_ETHIQUE_MEDICALE1.pdf (14th July 2010)

²⁰ National Medical Ethics Committee of Tunisia, 1997, Ethics and Therapy by Substitution of Organs http://www.comiteethique.rns.tn/ethique/CONFERENCES_ET_PUBLICATIONS/ETHIQUE_THERAPIE_SUBSTITUTION_ORGANES.pdf (14th July 2010)

²¹ Bioethics Advisory Committee Of Belgium, 2011, Opinion No. 50, May 9, 2011 on *certain aspects éthiques des modifications apportées par la loi du 25 février 2007 à la loi du 13 juin 1986 relative au prélèvement et à la transplantation d'organes*, Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/Belgium_Prelevement_transplantation_d_organes_FR_2011.pdf (22nd August 2012)

²² Bioethics Advisory Committee Of Belgium, 2007, Opinion No. 43, December 10, 2007 on the issue of commercialization of human body parts, Online Available from http://www.health.belgium.be/filestore/15532535_FR/avis%2043%20commercialisation_15532535_fr.pdf (15th July 2010)

<u>Cyprus (EURO)</u>	1. Opinion - Transplantation of Human Biological Substances ²⁴ (2003)
<u>Denmark (EURO)</u>	1. Published Letter - The Use of Living Children as Donors²⁵ (2010) 2. Opinion Paper - Organ Donation: Ethical Deliberations and Recommendations²⁶ (2008) 3. Consultation report - Notice on quality and safety for the donation, procurement and testing (human tissues and cells), with Annex: Commission Directive 2006/17/EC and the draft Guidelines for quality and safety for the donation, procurement and testing (human tissues and cells)²⁷ - (2006) 4. Opinion Paper - Living donors - An explanation about kidney donation and bone marrow donation²⁸ (1999) 5. Opinion Paper - Organ Donation: Informed or Presumed Consent²⁹ (1998) 6. Essay Collection - Give me your heart - Organ Donation ethical Dilemma³⁰ (1998)
<u>Finland (EURO)</u>	1. Opinion Paper - Opinion on the Increase in Organ Transplants ³¹ (2009)
<u>France (EURO)</u>	1. Opinion - Review on the Non-commercialization of the Human Body ³² (December 1990)

²³ Bioethics Advisory Committee Of Belgium, 1999, Opinion Paper - On The Collection of Organs and Tissues in Healthy Living Subjects for Transplantation, Online Available from http://www.health.belgium.be/filestore/7948480_FR/avis11-site_7948480_fr.pdf (15th July 2010)

²⁴ National Bioethics Committee of Cyprus, 2003, Opinion - Transplantation of Human Biological Substances, Online Available from <http://www.bioethics.gov.cy/Law/cnbc/cnbc.nsf/All/417A98179F4738DBC22571C90029F624?OpenDocument> (16th July 2010)

²⁵ The Danish Council of Ethics, 2010, Use of living children as donors, Online Available From http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=da&tl=en&u=http://www.etiskraad.dk/sw26637.asp&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhmcWW_VGoeekJBkDM2Vi4StbDHNQ (17th July 2010)

²⁶ Danish Council of Ethics, 2008, Opinion Paper - Organ Donation: Ethical Deliberations and Recommendations, Online Available From http://etiskraad.synkron.com/graphics/03_udgivelser/engelske_publicationer/organ_donation/organ_donation/hel epubl.htm (17th July 2010)

²⁷ Danish Council of Ethics, 2006, Consultation report - Notice on quality and safety for the donation, procurement and testing (human tissues and cells), with Annex: Commission Directive 2006/17/EC and the draft" Guidelines for quality and safety for the donation, procurement and testing (human tissues and cells), Online Available from http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=da&tl=en&u=http://www.etiskraad.dk/sw9448.asp&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhjA4RNLWejk9w7qm6JkjiVJnCA9aQ (17th July 2010)

²⁸ Danish Council of Ethics, 1999, Living donors - An explanation about kidney donation and bone marrow donation, Online, Available from http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=da&tl=en&u=http://www.etiskraad.dk/graphics/03_udgivelser/publikationer/organtranspl_og_doede/levende_9/INDEX.HTM&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhHT2Xr0F6zC2BecVd1YqivV-r5pA (17th July 2010)

²⁹ Danish Council of Ethics, 1998, Opinion Paper - Organ Donation: Informed or Presumed Consent, Online Available from: http://etiskraad.synkron.com/graphics/03_udgivelser/engelske_publicationer/organ_donation/orgdon_e/ren.htm (17th July 2010)

³⁰ Danish Council of Ethics, 1998b, Essay Collection - Give me your heart - Organ Donation ethical Dilemma, Online Available from: http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=da&tl=en&u=http://www.etiskraad.dk/graphics/03_udgivelser/publikationer/organtranspl_og_doede/givmig/r en.htm&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhZunLlbhyheBUJOBYOofdav96Qoaw (17th July 2010)

³¹ Finish National Advisory Board on Health Care Ethics, 2009, Opinion Paper - Opinion on the Increase in Organ Transplants, Online Available from <http://www.etene.org/en/materials/opinions/2009> (19th July 2010)

<u>Germany (EURO)</u>	Opinion paper - Increasing the number of organs donated - an urgent problem for transplantation medicine ³³ (2007).
<u>Greece (EURO)</u>	1. Comment - For the legislative address of Transplantation ³⁴ (2005)
<u>Ireland (EURO)</u>	1. Information Booklet - Organ Donation: The Gift of Life ³⁵ (2010) 2. Publication - Human Biological Material: Recommendations for collection use and storage for Research ³⁶ (2005)
<u>Italy (EURO)</u>	1. Statement - The criteria for ascertaining death ³⁷ (2010) 2. Statement - Kidney donation from a living donor to a stranger (so-called Samaritan donation) ³⁸ (2010) 3. Motion on the Sale of Organs for Transplantation ³⁹ (2004) 4. Opinion on the proposal for a moratorium on human xenotransplantation trials ⁴⁰ (1999) 5. Statement - The bioethical problem of kidney transplants from living unrelated donors ⁴¹ (1997) 6. Opinion - The anencephalic newborn and organ donation

³² French National Consultative Ethics Committee, 1990, Opinion paper - Increasing the number of organs donated - an urgent problem for transplantation medicine, Online Available from: http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=fr&tl=en&u=http://www.ccne-ethique.fr/docs/fr/avis021.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhjhspWXxTz3DN-ePR6NVbodYbs5fq (19th July 2010)

³³ The German National Ethics Council, 2007, Opinion paper - Increasing the number of organs donated - an urgent problem for transplantation medicine, Online Available from <http://translate.google.com.au/translate?u=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.ethikrat.org%2F&sl=de&tl=en&hl=&ie=UTF-8> 19th July 2010

³⁴ Hellenic National Bioethics Commission, 2005, For the legislative address of Transplantation, Online Available from http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&sl=el&tl=en&u=http://www.bioethics.gr/media/pdf/recommendations/transplant_gr.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhjveUC0PSCKBcmv4lz_eI9CgrGKQ (19th July 2010)

³⁵ Irish Council for Bioethics, Information Booklet - Organ Donation: The Gift of Life, Online Available from <http://www.bioethics.ie/uploads/docs/OrganDonation.pdf> (19th July 2010)

³⁶ Irish Council for Bioethics, 2005, Human Biological Material: Recommendations for collection use and storage for Research, Online Available from <http://www.bioethics.ie/uploads/docs/BiologicalMaterial.pdf> (19th July 2010)

³⁷ National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 2010, Statement - The criteria for ascertaining death, Online Available from: <http://translate.google.com.au/translate?u=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.governo.it%2Fbioetica%2Findex.html&sl=it&tl=en&hl=&ie=UTF-8>, (20th July 2010)

³⁸ National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 2010b, Statement - Kidney donation from a living donor to a stranger (so-called Samaritan donation), Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/Italy_Kydney_donation_EN_2010.pdf (22nd August 2012)

³⁹ National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 2004, Motion on the Sale of Organs for Transplantation, Online Available from <http://translate.google.com.au/translate?u=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.governo.it%2Fbioetica%2Findex.html&sl=it&tl=en&hl=&ie=UTF-8> (20th July 2010)

⁴⁰ National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 1999, Opinion on the proposal for a moratorium on human xenotransplantation trials, Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/Italy_proposal_for_a_moratorium_on_human_xenotransplantation_trials_EN_1999.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁴¹ National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 1997, Statement - The bioethical problem of kidney transplants from living unrelated donors, Online Available From <http://translate.google.com.au/translate?u=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.governo.it%2Fbioetica%2Findex.html&sl=it&tl=en&hl=&ie=UTF-8> (20th July 2010)

	(1996)⁴² 7. Statement - Organ Transplantation in Childhood⁴³ (1994) 8. Statement: Organ donation for transplantation⁴⁴ (1991)
<u>Luxemburg (EURO)</u>	1. Opinion - The diagnosis of Death related to organ donation⁴⁵ (2008) 2. Notice - Notice concerning the signing by the Luxembourg Protocol on Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin⁴⁶ (1999)
<u>The Netherlands (EURO)</u>	1. Publication - Living Donor List Exchange: an addition to the Dutch living kidney donor program?⁴⁷ (2007) 2. Publication - The benefit of HLA-matching in kidney transplantation⁴⁸ (2006) 3. Publication - New Options for Organ Donation⁴⁹ (2003) 4. Publication - Pediatric Heart Transplantation⁵⁰ (1999)
<u>Portugal (EURO)</u>	1. Opinion on the Draft Law on the Legal Regime of the quality and safety for the donation, collection, processing, preservation, storage, distribution and application of tissues and cells of human origin⁵¹ (55/CNECV/2008) 2. Opinion on the legal quality and safety for the donation, collection, processing, preservation, storage, distribution and application of tissues and cells of human origin⁵² (54/CNECV/2007)

⁴² National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 1999, Opinion - The anencephalic newborn and organ donation, Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/Italy_ANENCEPHALIC_NEWBORN_AND_ORGAN_donation_EN_1996.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁴³ National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 1994, Statement - Organ Transplantation in Childhood, Online Available From <http://translate.google.com.au/translate?u=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.governo.it%2Fbioetica%2Findex.html&sl=it&tl=en&hl=&ie=UTF-8> (20th July 2010)

⁴⁴ National Bioethics Committee of Italy, 1991, Statement - Organ donation for transplantation Online Available From <http://translate.google.com.au/translate?u=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.governo.it%2Fbioetica%2Findex.html&sl=it&tl=en&hl=&ie=UTF-8> (20th July 2010)

⁴⁵ Commission Consultative Nationale d'Ethique, 2008, Opinion - The diagnosis of Death related to organ donation, Online Available From; <http://www.cne.public.lu/publications/avis/index.html> (21st July 2010)

⁴⁶ Commission Consultative Nationale d'Ethique, 1998, Notice concerning the signing by the Luxembourg Protocol on Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin, Online Available From; <http://www.cne.public.lu/publications/avis/index.html> (21st July 2010)

⁴⁷ *The Health Council of the Netherland*, 2007, Living Donor List Exchange: an addition to the Dutch living kidney donor program?, Online Available from <http://www.gezondheidsraad.nl/en/publications/living-donor-list-exchange-addition-dutch-living-kidney-donor-programme> (21st July 2010)

⁴⁸ The Health Council of the Netherland, 2006, The benefit of HLA-matching in kidney transplantation, Online Available from, <http://www.gezondheidsraad.nl/en/publications/new-options-organ-donation> (21st July 2010)

⁴⁹ The Health Council of the Netherland, 2003, New Options for Organ Donation, Online Available from <http://www.gezondheidsraad.nl/en/publications/new-options-organ-donation> (21st July 2010)

⁵⁰ The Health Council of the Netherland, 1999, Pediatric Heart Transplantation, Online Available from <http://www.gezondheidsraad.nl/en/publications/pediatric-heart-transplantation>, (21st July 2010)

⁵¹ National Council of Ethics for the Life Sciences, 2008, Opinion on the Draft Law on the Legal Regime of the quality and safety for the donation, collection, processing, preservation, storage, distribution and application of tissues and cells of human origin, Online Available From http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=pt&tl=en&u=http://www.cnecv.pt/admin/files/data/docs/1273054047_P054_tecidoscelulasorigemhumana.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhjKsvdnnrFL99wo3dzRWSjYwfnrA (25th July 2010)

⁵² National Council of Ethics for the Life Sciences, 2007, Opinion on the legal quality and safety for the donation, collection, processing, preservation, storage, distribution and application of tissues and cells of human origin,

	- Opinion on the Proposed Law No. 65 / X - Amendment to Law No. 12/93 of April 22 - "Harvest and Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin"⁵³ (50/CNECV/2006) - Opinion on the Additional Protocol to the convention on human rights and Biomedicine concerning Transplantation of Organs and tissue of human origin.⁵⁴ (41/CNECV/2003) - Opinion on the National Register of Non-Donors (RENDA)⁵⁵ (5/CNECV/93) - Opinion of Tissue and Organ Transplantation⁵⁶ (1991)
<u>Russia (EURO)</u>	Document - Legal regulation of organ and tissue transplantation⁵⁷ (1998)
<u>Sweden (EURO)</u>	- Opinion on the on the Proposal for a Directive on quality and safety standards of human organs intended for transplantation⁵⁸ (S2008/10531/HS) - Opinion on transplants save lives⁵⁹ (2003) - Opinion on a law proposal concerning organ transplants. (2004)⁶⁰
<u>Switzerland (EURO)</u>	- Opinion - On the regulation of the living donation in the transplantation law⁶¹ (2003) - Avis - <i>Transplantation de foie d'une personne refusant toute transfusion de sang</i>⁶² (2008)

Online Available From: http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=pt&tl=en&u=http://www.cnecv.pt/admin/files/data/docs/1273054047_P054_tecidoscelulasorigemhumana.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhiKsvdnnrfl99wo3dzRWSjYwfnrA (25th July 2010)

⁵³ National Council of Ethics for the Life Sciences, 2006, Opinion on the Proposed Law No. 65 / X - Amendment to Law No. 12/93 of April 22 - "Harvest and Transplantation of Organs and Tissues of Human Origin", Online Available from http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=pt&tl=en&u=http://www.cnecv.pt/admin/files/data/docs/1273054241_P050_ParecerTransplantes.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhi49HYqB_nJqT575tn_eFeBmw8rRq (25th July 2010)

⁵⁴ National Council of Ethics for the Life Sciences, 2003, Opinion on the Additional Protocol to the convention on human rights and Biomedicine concerning Transplantation of Organs and tissue of human origin, Online Available From: http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=pt&tl=en&u=http://www.cnecv.pt/admin/files/data/docs/1273054241_P050_ParecerTransplantes.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhi49HYqB_nJqT575tn_eFeBmw8rRq (25th July 2010)

⁵⁵ National Council of Ethics for the Life Sciences, 1993, Opinion on the National Register of Non-Donors, Online Available from : http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=pt&tl=en&u=http://www.cnecv.pt/admin/files/data/docs/1273059577_P005_RENDA.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhi6r23oJhIC6c7wPxvJi5oRnZWGw (25th July 2010)

⁵⁶ National Council of Ethics for the Life Sciences, 1991, Opinion of Tissue and Organ Transplantation, Online Available from: http://translate.googleusercontent.com/translate_c?hl=en&ie=UTF-8&sl=pt&tl=en&u=http://www.cnecv.pt/admin/files/data/docs/1273059634_P001_TransplantesTecidosOrgaos.pdf&rurl=translate.google.com.au&usq=ALkJrhiX8k5BwHTgCKLVuS6UP_v97IXTPA (25th July 2010)

⁵⁷ Russian Committee For Bioethics, 1998, Legal regulation of organ and tissue transplantation, Online Available from: <http://www.bioethics.ru/rus/library/> (25th July 2010)

⁵⁸ Swedish National Council on Medical Ethics, 2008, Opinion on the on the Proposal for a Directive on quality and safety standards of human organs intended for transplantation, Online Available from <http://www.smer.se/Bazment/6.aspx> (26th July 2010)

⁵⁹ Swedish National Council on Medical Ethics, 2003, Opinion on transplants save lives, Online Available from <http://www.smer.se/Bazment/6.aspx> (26th July 2010)

⁶⁰ Swedish National Council on Medical Ethics, 2004, Opinion on a law proposal concerning organ transplants, Online available from: <http://www.smer.se/Bazment/62.aspx> (26th July 2010)

⁶¹ Swiss National Advisory Commission on Biomedical Ethics, 2003, Opinion - On the regulation of the living donation in the transplantation law, Online available from <http://www.bag.admin.ch/nek-cne/04229/04232/index.html?lang=en> (19th July 2010)

⁶² Swiss National Advisory Commission on Biomedical Ethics, 2008, Avis - *Transplantation de foie d'une personne refusant toute transfusion de sang*, Online Available from

	3. Opinion - Living-donor partial liver transplantation: the question of financing ⁶³ (2003) 4. Statement on the draft bill of the Federal law relating to the transplantation of organs, tissues and cells (Transplantation Law, TxG) ⁶⁴ (2000)
<u>United Kingdom (EURO)</u>	1. Report - Human bodies: donation for medicine and research ⁶⁵ (2011) 2. Report - Animal-to-Human Transplants ⁶⁶ (1996) 3. Report - Human tissues, Ethical and Legal issues ⁶⁷ (1995)
<u>India (SEARO)</u>	1. Publication - Ethical Guidelines for Biomedical Research on Human Participants ⁶⁸ (2006)
<u>Australia (WPRO)</u>	1. Consultation document - Ethics and the sale, exchange and profit from products derived from human tissue: An issue paper ⁶⁹ (2009) 2. Publication - Making a decision about living organ and tissue donation ⁷⁰ (2007) 3. Publication - Making a decision about organ and tissue donation after death ⁷¹ (2007) 4. Publication - Organ and Tissue Transplantation by living donors - guidelines for ethical practice by health care practitioners ⁷² (2007) 5. Publication Organ and Tissue donation after death for transplantation - guidelines for ethical practice by health care practitioners ⁷³ (2007)

http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/Switzerland_Transplantation_de_foie_avec_refus_transfusion_FR_2008.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁶³ Swiss National Advisory Commission on Biomedical Ethics, 2003b., Opinion - Living-donor partial liver transplantation: the question of financing, Online Available from <http://www.bag.admin.ch/nek-cne/04229/04232/index.html?lang=en> (19th July 2010)

⁶⁴ Swiss Ethics Committee on Non-human Gene Technology, 2000, Statement on the draft bill of the Federal law relating to the transplantation of organs, tissues and cells (Transplantation Law, TxG), Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/Switzerland_draft_bill_of_the_Transplantation_law_ECNH_EN_2000.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁶⁵ Nuffield Council on Bioethics, 2011, Human bodies: donation for medicine and research, Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/UK_Human_bodies_donation_for_medicine_and_research_EN_2011.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁶⁶ Nuffield Council on Bioethics, 1996, Animal-to-Human Transplants, Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/EURO/UK_Xenotransplantation_EN_1996.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁶⁷ Nuffield Council on Bioethics, 1995, Human tissues, Ethical and Legal issues, Online Available from <http://www.nuffieldbioethics.org/go/ourwork/humantissue/publicationlist> (17th July 2010)

⁶⁸ Indian Council of Medical Research, 2006, Ethical Guidelines for Biomedical Research on Human Participants, Online Available from http://www.icmr.nic.in/ethical_guidelines.pdf (16th July 2010)

⁶⁹ Australian Health Ethics Committee, 2009, Ethics and the sale, exchange and profit from products derived from human tissue: An issue paper, Online Available from http://www.nhmrc.gov.au/files/nhmrc/file/health_ethics/ahec/public_consultation_draft.pdf (16th July 2010)

⁷⁰ National Health and Medical Research Council, 2007, Making a decision about living organ and tissue donation Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/WPRO/Australia_MAKING_A_DECISION_ABOUT_living_organ_and_tissue_donation_EN_2007.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁷¹ National Health and Medical Research Council, 2007, Making a decision about organ and tissue donation after death, Online Available from http://apps.who.int/ethics/nationalcommittees/Opinionsweb/WPRO/Australia_MAKING_A_DECISION_ABOUT_organ_and_tissue_donation_after_death_EN_2007.pdf (22nd August 2012)

⁷² Australian Health Ethics Committee, 2007, Organ and Tissue Transplantation by living donors - guidelines for ethical practice by health care practitioners. Online Available from http://www.nhmrc.gov.au/publications/synopses/e70_1_4_5syn.htm (16th July 2010)

Singapore (WPRO)	1. Report - Human tissue Research⁷⁴ (2002) 2. Document - Ethical guidelines on Human Organ and Tissue Transplantation⁷⁵ (2010)
---------------------	---

⁷³ Australian Health Ethics Committee, 2007, Organ and Tissue donation after death for transplantation-guidelines for ethical practice by health care practitioner, Online Available from; http://www.nhmrc.gov.au/publications/synopses/e70_1_4_5syn.htm (16th July 2010)

⁷⁴ Singapore Bioethics Advisory Commission, 2002, Human Tissue Research, Online Available from <http://www.bioethics-singapore.org/uploadfile/60104%20PMHT%20Research.pdf> (15th July 2010)

⁷⁵ Singapore Ministry of Health, 1997, Ethical Guidelines on Human Organ and Tissue Transplantation, Online Available from http://www.moh.gov.sg/mohcorp/uploadedFiles/Publications/Guidelines/hot_tpt.pdf (15th July 2010)

Annex 2. Alignment of NECs statements on organ donation or transplantation and the WHO Guiding Principles on Human Cell, Tissue and Organ Transplantation⁶⁷

	Principle One	Principle Two	Principle Three	Principle Four	Principle Five	Principle Six	Principle Seven	Principle Eight	Principle Nine	Principle Ten	Principle Eleven
Mexico			X								
Tunisia	X		X	X	X				X		X
Belgium			X	X	X			X			X
Cyprus	X			X					X		X
Denmark	X	X	X	X		X					
France					X			X			
Germany	X							X			
Greece	X		X								
Ireland	X		X	X	X			X	X		X
Italy	X		X	X	X			X	X		X
Luxemburg	X		X		X	X			X		X
The Netherlands					X				X		X
Portugal	X		X	X	X				X	X	X
Sweden	X		X							X	X
Switzerland			X	X	X				X	X	X
United Kingdom	X		X	X	X			X		X	X
India	X		X	X	X			X		X	X
Australia	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Singapore	X	X	X	X	X	X			X		X
	14	3	15	12	13	4	1	8	10	6	14

⁶⁷ World Health Organization (2010) *Guiding Principles on human cell, tissue and organ transplantation*.